

Contents

1	INTRODUCTION	11
1.1	MEDIA LAW: AN OVERVIEW	11
1.2	THE PURPOSE AND FUNCTION OF MEDIA LAW . .	13
1.3	THE CONTENT OF THIS OUTLINE	14
I	THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK	17
2	FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION: INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS AND THEORIES	21
2.1	THE INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS	24
2.2	THE APPLICATION OF INTERNATIONAL LAW . . .	26
2.2.1	Status of multilateral treaties	26
2.2.2	The Sources of International Law.	27
2.2.2.1	Treaty Law	27
2.2.2.2	Status of treaty law with respect to the national constitution and statutes	28
2.2.2.3	Customary International Law and General Principles as Sources of International Law	28
2.3	FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION IS A UNIVERSAL RIGHT .	29
2.4	THEORIES: WHY PROTECT SPEECH?	29
2.4.1	Market Place of Ideas	30

2.4.2	Value for the individual	31
2.4.3	System of Freedom of Expression.	31
2.4.3.1	Essential for individual self-fulfilment.	31
2.4.3.2	Essential for the quest for knowledge and discovery of truth	32
2.4.3.3	Essential for participation in decision-making for effective social change	32
2.4.3.4	Essential for a stable and adaptable society	32
2.5	THE FUNCTION OF THE RIGHT OF FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION AT DIFFERENT LEVELS.	32
2.5.1	Individual level.	33
2.5.2	National level	33
2.5.3	Promotes effective law-making	34
2.5.4	Helps implement other human rights	34
2.6	AREAS THAT INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS ON FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION HIGHLIGHT BEING AREAS MEDIA SHOULD BE CONCERNED ABOUT	34
2.7	RESTRICTIONS ON THE RIGHT TO FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION THAT ARE RELEVANT IN THE CONTEXT OF INTERNATIONAL LAW	37
2.7.1	Restrictions Based on Threats to National Security or Public Order	37
2.7.2	Content-Related Restrictions	37
2.7.3	Prior Censorship	37
2.7.4	Non-Content Based Regulation	38
2.8	INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS AND THE LEGITIMACY OF RESTRICTIONS ON THE RIGHT TO FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION	38
2.8.1	Freedom of expression a fundamental principle, but not an absolute principle	38
2.8.2	Three-part test for legitimacy of restrictions	38
3	SOURCES OF MEDIA LAW IN PAKISTAN	41
3.1	THE BRITISH LEGACY	42

3.2	FREEDOM OF SPEECH AND THE CONSTITUTION . . .	44
3.2.1	Constitutional Guarantee Regarding the Right to Freedom of Expression.	44
3.2.2	Restrictions Placed on the Guarantee	44
3.3	FREEDOM OF SPEECH AND ISLAMIC LAW.	45
3.3.1	Islamic provisions in the Constitution. . . .	45
3.3.2	Fundamental/Human Rights v. Islamic law . .	47
3.3.2.1	Human Rights and the Emergency Provisions in the Constitution	47
3.3.2.2	Islamic law and fundamental rights guaranteed in the Constitution	48
3.3.3	Restrictions based on Islamic law in the law of Pakistan	50
3.3.4	Understanding Islamic law	51
3.3.4.1	The two faces of the <i>maqāṣid</i>	52
3.3.4.2	Priorities within the <i>maqāṣid</i>	53
3.3.4.3	The <i>maqāṣid al-sharī'ah</i> and the right to freedom of expression.	54
3.4	STATUTES	56
3.4.1	Acts and Ordinances	56
3.4.2	Rules and Regulations	59
3.5	COURT DECISIONS AND THE LAW OF TORTS . . .	59
4	ACCESS TO INFORMATION	61
4.1	INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS ON FOI	64
4.1.1	The Standards	64
4.1.2	Limitations	64
4.2	PRINCIPLES OF FOI: ARTICLE 19 GLOBAL CAMPAIGN FOR FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION	66
4.2.1	Principle 1. Maximum Disclosure	67
4.2.2	Principle 2. Obligation to Publish	67
4.2.3	Principle 3. Promotion of Open Government .	67
4.2.4	Principle 4. Limited Scope of Exceptions. . .	68
4.2.5	Principle 5. Processes to Facilitate Access. . .	68
4.2.6	Principle 6. Costs	68

4.2.7	Principle 7. Open Meetings	68
4.2.8	Principle 8. Disclosure Takes Precedence. . .	68
4.2.9	Principle 9. Protection for Whistleblowers . .	68
4.3	THE FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ORDINANCE, 2002	69
4.3.1	Access to information acknowledged as a right	69
4.3.2	Access to records	71
4.3.3	Access to the law of the land.	73
4.3.4	Exempt information.	75
4.3.5	Suggestions for clarifying meanings in the Free- dom of Information Ordinance	76
4.3.5.1	Record as information	76
4.3.5.2	The Ordinance stands subordinated to other laws	77
4.3.5.3	Citizen or “any person”	77
 II NEWS-GATHERING AND TORTS		 79
5	DEFAMATION	83
5.1	THE LAW OF DEFAMATION IN PAKISTAN.	86
5.1.1	Defamation is both a tort and a crime.	86
5.1.2	The Defamation Ordinance, 2002 and Interna- tional Standards	89
5.1.3	The law of defamation in a poor country like Pakistan	89
5.2	THE CRIMINALISATION OF DEFAMATION AND INTER- NATIONAL STANDARDS	92
5.2.1	The provisions of the Pakistan Penal Code . .	92
5.2.1.1	The relevant sections of the Code	92
5.2.1.2	The ingredients of the three offences	94
5.2.2	Rejection of defamation as a crime by interna- tional standards	95
5.3	THE TORT OF DEFAMATION AND THE DEFAMATION ORDINANCE	96
5.3.1	Meaning of “defamation” in the Ordinance. .	96

5.3.2	<i>Prima facie</i> case to be shown by the plaintiff	98
5.3.2.1	Defamatory statement	98
5.3.2.2	Publication	98
5.3.2.3	Fault.	98
5.3.2.4	Special harm.	98
5.3.3	Defamatory Communication	99
5.3.3.1	Injury to reputation	99
5.3.3.2	Meaning need not be apparent from face of the statement	99
5.3.3.3	The reference must be to plaintiff	99
5.3.4	Publication	100
5.3.5	Defences	101
5.3.5.1	Truth and denial of liability	101
5.3.5.1.1	<i>Defendant denies that he made the statement.</i>	101
5.3.5.1.2	<i>Defendant proves that statement was true . . .</i>	101
5.3.5.2	The statement was pure opinion.	102
5.3.6	Privileges	102
5.3.6.1	Absolute privileges	102
5.3.6.1.1	<i>Judicial proceedings.</i>	102
5.3.6.1.2	<i>Legislative proceedings.</i>	103
5.3.6.1.3	<i>Government officials</i>	103
5.3.6.2	Privileged communications	103
5.3.6.2.1	<i>Defendant proves that plaintiff had consented to the publication of the statement</i>	103
5.3.6.3	Qualified privilege.	103
5.3.6.3.1	<i>Public interest.</i>	104
5.3.6.3.2	<i>Personal interest or interest of another</i>	104
5.3.7	Remedies	105
5.3.7.1	Damages	105
5.3.7.1.1	<i>Compensatory damages</i>	105
5.3.7.1.2	<i>Punitive damages</i>	105
5.3.7.1.3	<i>Nominal damages</i>	106
5.3.7.1.4	<i>Presumed damages as compensatory damages.</i>	106
5.3.7.1.5	<i>General damages v. special damages</i>	106
5.3.7.2	Retraction and apology	106

5.3.8	Limitation for Defamation Claims	107
5.3.8.1	Required notice within two months	107
5.3.8.2	Action required within six months of knowledge of defamation	107
5.4	CRITICISM OF THE DEFAMATION ORDINANCE	108
6	THE RIGHT TO PRIVACY AND NEWS GATHER- ING TORTS	111
6.1	THE RIGHT TO PRIVACY, MEDIA AND FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION	112
6.1.1	The Two Dimensions of the Right to Privacy	113
6.1.1.1	Protections directed against infringement by gov- ernmental authorities	113
6.1.1.2	Protections against the intrusion into privacy by the media	114
6.1.2	Public Figures Who Submit Themselves to Pub- lic Scrutiny	114
6.2	GROWTH OF RIGHT TO PRIVACY IN PAKISTAN	115
6.3	THE RIGHT TO PRIVACY IN THE REST OF THE WORLD	116
6.3.1	The right to privacy in the United States and Europe	116
6.3.2	The right to privacy in India	120
6.4	FUTURE OF THE RIGHT TO PRIVACY IN PAKISTAN	122
6.5	NEWS GATHERING AND PUBLICATION RELATED LE- GAL ISSUES	123
6.5.1	News-Gathering-Related Legal Issues	124
6.5.1.1	Trespass	124
6.5.1.2	Intrusion	125
6.5.1.3	Surveillance	126
6.5.1.4	Recording of Conversations	126
6.5.2	Publication-Related Violations	126
6.5.2.1	Public disclosure of private facts	127
6.5.2.2	False light	127
6.5.2.2.1	<i>The meaning of false light</i>	127
6.5.2.2.2	<i>The right of reply</i>	128

6.5.2.3 Appropriation	129
7 INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY	131
7.1 BACKGROUND: INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS . . .	132
7.1.1 Meaning and Types of Intellectual Property .	132
7.1.2 International Standards and Instruments . .	133
7.2 INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY AND THE MEDIA . . .	136
7.3 THE COPYRIGHT ORDINANCE, 1962	137
7.3.1 What is copyright?	137
7.3.2 Ownership and transfer of copyright	138
7.3.2.1 First owner of copyright.	139
7.3.2.2 Assignment of copyright	139
7.3.2.3 Owner for purposes of civil remedy	139
7.3.2.4 Special or moral rights	140
7.3.3 Period of copyright	140
7.3.4 Registration of copyright	141
7.3.5 Remedies	141
7.3.5.1 Civil remedies	141
7.3.5.1.1 <i>Remedy through court.</i>	142
7.3.5.1.2 <i>Remedy through Copyright Board.</i>	143
7.3.5.2 Remedies through criminal prosecution . . .	143
7.4 ISSUES FOR THE MEDIA	145
7.4.1 Fair Use of Copyrighted Material.	145
7.4.2 The Right of Publicity	147
8 REPORTER'S PRIVILEGE	149
8.1 INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS AND PROTECTION OF SOURCES	151
8.1.1 The Rationale Underlying the Right to Protect Sources.	151
8.1.2 International Standards and the Scope of the Right.	152
8.1.3 Exception to the Right	154

8.2	REPORTER'S PRIVILEGE IN DOMESTIC LAW IN OTHER JURISDICTIONS	155
8.2.1	Reporter's Shield Laws in the U.S. and the Common Law	155
8.2.2	The U.K. Contempt of Court Act, 1981.	157
8.3	REPORTER'S PRIVILEGE AND PAKISTAN	157
8.4	SEARCH AND SEIZURE OF GATHERED JOURNALISTIC MATERIAL	158
9	THE LAW OF CONTEMPT AND ACCESS TO COURT PROCEEDINGS	161
9.1	THE LAW OF CONTEMPT.	162
9.1.1	History of contempt power	162
9.1.2	The Contempt of Court Ordinance, 2003	163
9.1.2.1	Definition of contempt	164
9.1.2.2	Kinds of contempt.	165
9.1.2.3	Contempt and the Press.	167
9.1.2.3.1	<i>Fair reporting.</i>	167
9.1.2.3.2	<i>Fair comments</i>	167
9.1.2.3.3	<i>Protected statements</i>	167
9.1.3	What if the Order of the Court is <i>Prima Facie</i> Unconstitutional	168
9.2	ACCESS TO JUDICIAL PROCEEDINGS AND RECORDS.	169
9.2.1	Open Courts and Fair Trials.	169
9.2.2	Biased Crime Reporting	170
9.2.3	Balancing the conflicting interests	172
III	REGULATION OF THE MEDIA	177
10	GROUNDS FOR CONTENT REGULATION	181
10.1	OBSCENITY.	182
10.2	BLASPHEMY.	187
10.3	HATE SPEECH	189
10.4	FIGHTING WORDS	191

10.5 NATIONAL SECURITY	192
10.5.1 Integrity, Security and Defence of Pakistan	192
10.5.2 National Security and International Standards	194
11 PRIOR RESTRAINTS	197
11.1 WHAT IS A PRIOR RESTRAINT?	197
11.1.1 The meaning and origin of the idea.	197
11.1.2 Pre-publication restraint versus post-publication penalty	199
11.2 PRIOR RESTRAINTS IN THE LIGHT OF INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS.	200
11.3 PRIOR RESTRAINTS AND PAKISTAN.	204
12 REGULATION OF THE PRESS AND THE PRINT MEDIA	207
12.1 PRESS COUNCIL OF PAKISTAN ORDINANCE, 2002	208
12.1.1 The Purpose of the Council and Structure of the Ordinance.	208
12.1.2 The Functions of Council.	209
12.1.3 The Ethical Code of Practice	210
12.1.3.1 The articles of the Ethical Code	211
12.1.3.2 Criticism of the Ethical Code	214
12.2 PRESS, NEWSPAPERS, NEWS AGENCIES AND BOOKS REGISTRATION ORDINANCE, 2002	216
12.2.1 Summary of the Ordinance	216
12.2.2 International Standards on Registration	218
12.2.3 Criticism of the Ordinance	219
13 REGULATION OF BROADCASTING AND BROAD- CAST JOURNALISM	221
13.1 THE LAWS GOVERNING BROADCASTING IN PAKISTAN	222
13.2 THE STRUCTURE OF THE AUTHORITY	223
13.3 LICENSES ISSUED BY THE AUTHORITY	224
13.4 PRIOR RESTRAINTS AND CONTENT RESTRICTIONS.	228
13.4.1 Content Restrictions	228

13.4.2	Prior Restraints or Censorship.	232
--------	---	-----

IV	APPENDIX: STATUTES SECTION	235
-----------	-----------------------------------	------------